

# The publication date of *Cinclodes comechingonus* Zotta & Gavio and *Porphyryula georgica* Pereyra

George Sangster

COPYRIGHT: © 2020 Sangster. This is an open-access article distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution Licence, which permits unrestricted use, distribution, and reproduction in any medium, provided the original author and source are credited.

ABSTRACT: Two bird species described in the December 1944 issue of the journal *El Hornero* were actually published in August 1945.

KEYWORDS: date of publication, *El Hornero*, *Cinclodes comechingonus*, Cordoba Cinclodes, *Porphyryula georgica*, Purple Gallinule.

While researching changes in the time lag between discovery and description of new bird species (Sangster & Luksenburg 2015), I found *prima facie* evidence of two erroneous publication dates. The names *Cinclodes comechingonus* Zotta & Gavio and *Porphyryula georgica* Pereyra were both published in the third issue of Volume 8 of *El Hornero*. The lead page of this issue was dated December 1944. Subsequent ornithological reference works have almost always given the publication date of *Cinclodes comechingonus* as 1944 (e.g. Peters, 1951, Mayr, 1957, Wolters, 1977, Dickinson & Christidis, 2014, Remsen, 2014, Gill & Donsker, 2020). The only exception seems to be Vaurie (1980), who noted that Zotta & Gavio's paper was "actually published in 1945". Similarly, the publication date of *Porphyryula georgica* has always been given as 1944 (e.g. Mayr, 1957, Taylor & van Perlo, 1998, Dickinson & Remsen, 2013).

That issue 3 of Volume 8 of *El Hornero* was not published in 1944 is clearly shown by the contents of this issue. On the first page of the original description of *Cinclodes comechingonus*, the holotype was stated to have been collected on 10 January 1945 (Zotta & Gavio "1944": 370). In their review of the type specimens in the Museo Argentino de Ciencias Naturales in Buenos Aires, Navas & Camperi (1999) also stated that the holotype was collected in 1945. Because this was based on label data, the 1945 date in the original description is almost certainly correct. Elsewhere in the original description of *Cinclodes comechingonus*, Zotta & Gavio ("1944": 372) referred to other specimens collected in January 1945: "En enero de 1945, los firmantes de esta nota obtuvieron en el mismo lugar 6 ejemplares junto con una pequeña pero interesante colección de aves que será objeto de un trabajo especial." Furthermore, on page 543 in the same issue of *El Hornero*, Doello-Jurado ("1944") referred to a necrology of W. L. Sclater published in the January 1945 issue of *The Ibis*.

Fortunately, the publication date of issue 3 of Volume 8 of *El Hornero* was documented on its last page (p. 390), which included the print date 31 August 1945. Thus, both *Cinclodes comechingonus* Zotta & Gavio and *Porphyryula georgica* Pereyra should be dated from 1945.

## ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I thank Alison Harding for verifying the time stamp in the copies of *El Hornero* Volume 8 (3) in Tring and South Kensington.



## REFERENCES

- Dickinson, E.C. & L. Christidis (Eds.) (2014). *The Howard and Moore complete checklist of the birds of the world*. Fourth edition. Volume 2: Passerines. i-iii, 1-752. – Aves Press, U.K.
- Dickinson, E.C. & J.V. Remsen (ed.), 2013. *The Howard & Moore Complete Checklist of the Birds of the World*. Fourth Edition. Volume 1: Non-passerines. i-l, 1-461. – Aves Press, U.K.
- Doello-Jurado, M. ("1944" = 1945). William Lutley Sclater, 1863-1944. – *Hornero*, 8 (3): 543-545.
- Gill, F. & D. Donsker (Eds.) (2020). *IOC World Bird List*. Version 10.1. (retrieved from <http://www.worldbirdnames.org/> on 21 April 2020).
- Mayr, E. (1957). New species of birds described from 1941-1955. – *Journal für Ornithologie*, 98 (1): 22-35.
- Navas, J. & A. Camperi (1999). Los tipos de aves que se conservan en el Museo Argentino de Ciencias Naturales de Buenos Aires. – *Revista del Museo Argentino de Ciencias Naturales, nueva serie*, 1 (1): 109-113.
- Pereyra, J.A. ("1944" = 1945). Descripción de un nuevo ejemplar de rálido de la isla Georgia del Sud. – *Hornero*, 8 (3): 484-490.
- Peters, J.L., 1951. *Check-list of birds of the world*. 7: i-x, 1-318. – Museum of Comparative Zoology, Cambridge, Massachusetts.
- Remsen, J.V., Jr (2014). *Cordoba Cinclodes (Cinclodes comechingonus)*, version 1.0. In: *Birds of the World*. J. del Hoyo, A. Elliott, J. Sargatal, D. A. Christie, and E. de Juana (Eds.). Cornell Lab of Ornithology, Ithaca, NY, USA. (retrieved from <https://doi.org/10.2173/bow.corcin1.01> on 6 May 2020).
- Sangster, G. & J.A. Luksenburg (2015). Declining rates of species described per taxonomist: slowdown of progress or a side-effect of improved quality in taxonomy? – *Systematic Biology*, 64 (1): 144-151.
- Taylor, P.B. & B. van Perlo (1998). *Rails, a guide to the rails, crakes, gallinules and coots of the world*. 1-600. – Pica Press, Robertsbridge, U.K.
- Vaurie, C. (1980). Taxonomy and geographical distribution of the Furnariidae (Aves, Passeriformes). – *Bulletin of the American Museum of Natural History*, 166: 1-357.
- Wolters, H.E. (1977). *Die Vogelarten der Erde. Eine systematische Liste mit verbreitungsangaben sowie deutschen und englischen Namen*. Lief. 3: 161-240. – Paul Parey, Hamburg.
- Zotta, A.R. & H.S. Gavio ("1944" = 1945). Una nueva especie del género *Cinclodes*. – *Hornero* 8 (3): 370-378.

---

Address: Dr. George Sangster, Naturalis Biodiversity Center, Darwinweg 2, PO Box 9517, 2300 RA Leiden, The Netherlands. e-mail: [g.sangster@planet.nl](mailto:g.sangster@planet.nl).